#### Volume X:1 Winter 2010

2010 by the Yale Journal of Health Policy, Law, and Ethics.
 All rights reserved, ISSN 1535-3532.
 No Claim to Original U.S. Government Works.

Stamissions: We invite the submission of germane manuscripts to the Yale Journal of Health Policy, Law, and Ethics. Submissions are accepted on a rolling basis. Please include (1) an electronic copy of the manuscript (double-spaced); (2) your current address, telephone number, email address, and CV; and (3) a 100-word abstract. Submissions should be emailed to yihple.submissions@yale.edu or submitted via ExpressO. Details about our editorial style are available on our website.

PEER REVIEW: Articles submitted to the *Journal* are peer reviewed. For a detailed description of our peer review process, please visit our website: www.yale.edu/yjhple.

**SUBSCRIPTIONS:** The *Journal* is published biannually. Subscriptions are \$29 per year for individuals and \$39 for institutions. Institutional rates apply to libraries, law firms, institutions, and individuals whose employer pays for subscriptions. Please add \$10 for overseas mailing.

Claims for non-receipt of issues should be made within 90 days of the month of publication for domestic subscribers and within 180 days for overseas subscribers. Thereafter, the regular back issue rate will be charged for replacement. All subscriptions will be renewed automatically unless the subscriber provides cancellation notice prior to September 1 of each new publication year. Please allow three months for overseas deliveries.

LEGAL NOTICES: The *Journal* is published by the Yale Schools of Law, Medicine, Public Health, and Nursing. The Editorial Staff, with the assistance of the Advisory Board, makes all decisions regarding the content of the *Journal*. Statements of fact and opinion are the sole responsibility of the authors and are not necessarily endorsed by the editors, Yale University, or any of Yale's professional or graduate schools. For permission to photocopy articles or other materials appearing in the *Journal*, contact the Editorial Staff at the address below.

#### MAILING ADDRESS

Yale Journal of Health Policy, Law, and Ethics P.O. Box 208215 New Haven, CT 06520-8215

# **OVERNIGHT DELIVERY ADDRESS**

Yale Journal of Health Policy, Law, and Ethics 127 Wall Street New Haven, CT 06511

www.yale.edu/yjhple

Tel: 203.436.0774

E-mail: yjhple(a yale.edu

#### Founding Members

Chetan Gulati, J.D. Chris Herndon, M.D.

Leslie A. Meltzer, J.D., M.Sc., Ph.D(c) Jason Silvers, M.D., J.D.

# YALE JOURNAL OF HEALTH POLICY, LAW, AND ETHICS

VOLUME X WINTER 2010

#### EXECUTIVE EDITORIAL BOARD

Editors-in-Chief Michael Lee, Jr. Jeffrey M. Tebbs

Executive Editors
Courtney Carrell
Vikram Fielding-Singh

Managing Editor
Lauren Gerber

#### SENIOR EDITORIAL BOARD

Article Editors	Submissions Chairs
Alice Hwang	Carolyn Brokowski
Otis Pitts	Catherine Simonsen
Marie Rymut	Maggie Wittlin, Notes
Rachel Zernik	

Webmaster Kyaw (Joe) Sint Senior Submissions Editor
Ben Stern

# YALE JOURNAL OF HEALTH POLICY, LAW, AND ETHICS

### VOLUME X

**WINTER 2010** 

#### STAFF EDITORS

Hannah Arem
Harrison Bai
Dana Barnes
Jeremy J. Blanchard
Kathryn Bradley
Hannah Byrnes-Enoch
Debbie Chin
Heather Cole-Lewis
Matthew Jon Hegreness
Benjamin Himes
Whitney Hubbard
Melody Hwang
Whitney Johnson

X 29 .A335 v.10 2010 Zachary Keller
Dorothy Kwok
Dilpreet Minhas
Rachel Morris
Varnee Murugan
Kyle Ragins
Eva Rigamonti
Christopher Sauer
Keerthika Subramanian
Jessica Qu
Anita Viciana
Jonathan Weiss
Jennifer Wu

ii

# ADVISORY BOARD

- Henry J. Aaron, Ph.D., Senior Fellow, Brookings Institution
- Lori B. Andrews, J.D., Professor, Chicago-Kent College of Law
- George J. Annas, J.D., M.P.H., *Professor, Boston University Schools of Law, Medicine, and Public Health*
- John D. Arras, Ph.D., Porterfield Professor of Biomedical Ethics, University of Virginia
- M. Gregg Bloche, M.D., J.D., Professor of Law, Georgetown University, and Co-Director, Georgetown-Johns Hopkins Joint Program in Law & Public Health
- Troyen A. Brennan, M.A., M.D., J.D., M.P.H., Executive Vice President and Chief Medical Officer, CVS Caremark
- Scott Burris, J.D., Professor, Temple University School of Law
- Robert A. Burt, J.D., Alexander M. Bickel Professor of Law, Yale Law School
- James F. Childress, Ph.D., Professor, University of Virginia
- Paul D. Cleary, Ph.D., Dean and C.E.A. Winslow Professor of Epidemiology and Public Health, Yale University School of Public Health
- Ruth R. Faden, Ph.D., M.P.H., Philip Franklin Wagley Professor of Biomedical Ethics and Director, The Phoche R. Berman Bioethics Institute, Johns Hopkins University
- John C. Fletcher, Ph.D., Professor Emeritus, University of Virginia School of Medicine
- Lawrence O. Gostin, J.D., L.L.D., Professor and Director, Center for Law and the Public's Health, Georgetown and Johns Hopkins Universities
- Christine Grady, R.N., Ph.D., Head, Section of Human Subjects Research, Department of Clinical Bioethics, National Institutes of Health
- Dean M. Hashimoto, M.D., J.D., M.P.H., Associate Professor of Law, Boston College, and Chief of Occupational and Environmental Medicine, Massachusetts General Hospital and the Brigham and Women's Hospital
- Timothy S. Jost, J.D., Robert L. Willett Family Professor of Law, Washington and Lee University School of Law
- Ruth Katz, J.D., M.P.H., Dean and Walter G. Ross Professor of Health Policy, George Washington University School of Public Health and Health Services
- David Kessler, M.D., J.D., Dean, University of California, San Francisco School of Medicine, and Former Commissioner of the U.S. Food and Drug Administration
- Alvin K. Klevorick, Ph.D., John Thomas Smith Professor of Law and Professor of Economics, Yale Law School and Yale University Department of Economics
- C. Everett Koop, M.D., Sc.D., Senior Scholar, C. Everett Koop Institute at Dartmouth
  College and Former Surgeon General of the United States
- Stephen R. Latham, J.D., Ph.D., Deputy Director, Yale's Interdisciplinary Center on Bioethics
- Jerold R. Mande, M.P.H, Director of Policy Programs, Yale University School of Medicine
- Theodore R. Marmor, Ph.D., Professor, Yale University School of Management and Yale Law School
- Leslie Meltzer, J.D., M.Sc., Greenwall Fellow in Bioethics and Health Policy, Georgetown University Law Center and the Johns Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health
- Theodore W. Ruger, J.D., Professor, University of Pennsylvania Law School
- Elyn R. Saks, M.Litt., J.D., Orrin B. Evans Professor of Law, Psychology, and Psychiatry and the Behavioral Sciences, University of Southern California Gould School of Law