Volume XIII:1 Winter 2013

©2013 by the Yale Journal of Health Policy, Law, and Ethics. All rights reserved. ISSN 1535-3532. No Claim to Original U.S. Government Works.

Submissions: We invite the submission of germane manuscripts to the Yale Journal of Health Policy, Law, and Ethics. Submissions are accepted on a rolling basis. Please include (1) an electronic copy of the manuscript (double-spaced); (2) your current address, telephone number, email address, and CV; and (3) a 100-word abstract. Submissions should be emailed to yjhple.submissions@yale.edu or submitted via ExpressO or LexOpus. Details about our editorial style are available on our website.

PEER REVIEW: Articles submitted to the Journal are peer reviewed. For a detailed description of our peer review process, please visit our website: www.yale.edu/yjhple.

Subscriptions: The Journal is published biannually. Subscriptions are \$29 per year for individuals and \$39 for institutions. Institutional rates apply to libraries, law firms, institutions, and individuals whose employer pays for subscriptions. Please add \$10 for overseas mailing.

Claims for non-receipt of issues should be made within 90 days of the month of publication for domestic subscribers and within 180 days for overseas subscribers. Thereafter, the regular back issue rate will be charged for replacement. All subscriptions will be renewed automatically unless the subscriber provides cancellation notice prior to September 1 of each new publication year. Please allow three months for overseas deliveries.

LEGAL NOTICES: The *Journal* is published by the Yale Schools of Law, Medicine, Public Health, and Nursing. The Editorial Staff, with the assistance of the Advisory Board, makes all decisions regarding the content of the Journal. Statements of fact and opinion are the sole responsibility of the authors and are not necessarily endorsed by the editors, Yale University, or any of Yale's professional or graduate schools. For permission to photocopy articles or other materials appearing in the Journal, contact the Editorial Staff at the address below.

MAILING ADDRESS

OVERNIGHT DELIVERY ADDRESS Yale Journal of Health Policy. Yale Journal of Health Policy,

Law, and Ethics Law, and Ethics P.O. Box 208215 127 Wall Street

New Haven, CT 06520-8215 New Haven, CT 06511

www.yale.edu/yjhple, E-mail: yjhple@yale.edu

Founding Members

Chetan Gulati, J.D. * Chris Herndon, M.D. Leslie A. Meltzer, J.D., M.Sc., Ph.D(c) * Jason Silvers, M.D., J.D.

YALE JOURNAL OF HEALTH POLICY, LAW, AND ETHICS

VOLUME XIII **WINTER 2013**

EXECUTIVE EDITORIAL BOARD

Editors-in-Chief

Jamie Brooks Laura Keay

Executive Editors

Carolyn E. Brokowski Anna Shabalov

Manaaina Editor **Gwen Cassidy**

SENIOR EDITORIAL BOARD

Article Editors

Anjali Motgi Yunsoo Kim Adam Toporovsky Elizabeth T. Kim (Note) Submissions Editors

Sarah Caruana Alix Rogers Jane Tucker, Notes

Webmaster Garth Strohbehn

YALE JOURNAL OF HEALTH POLICY, LAW, AND ETHICS

VOLUME XIII WINTER 2013

STAFF EDITORS

Adigun Agboola Andrea Alvarez Marin Sean Arenson Jonathan Atkins Kyra Ayo Caros Danny Bousquet Peter Bozzo Willa Campbell Ariana Chao Miika Fukuwa Rose Goldberg* Maya Hodis Sung Jin Veronica Jordan-Davis Young-Hee Kim* Claudia Kraft*

Eugene Lee
Ike Lee*
Aditya Mahalingam-Dhingra
Kimberly Miller-Tolbert
Brittany Ngo
Julius Oatts
Julian Prokopetz
Travis Rabbit
Avanika Saraf
Jake Siegel
Roseanna Sommers
Surabhi Srivastava
Alex Setzepfandt
Nicole West
Xianglong Zhu

ADVISORY BOARD

Henry J. Aaron, Ph.D., Senior Fellow, Brookings Institution

Lori B. Andrews, J.D., Professor, Chicago-Kent College of Law

George J. Annas, J.D., M.P.H., *Professor, Boston University Schools of Law, Medicine, and Public Health*

John D. Arras, Ph.D., Porterfield Professor of Biomedical Ethics, University of Virginia

M. Gregg Bloche, M.D., J.D., Professor of Law, Georgetown University, and Co-Director,

Georgetown-Johns Hopkins Joint Program in Law & Public Health

Troyen A. Brennan, M.A., M.D., J.D., M.P.H., Executive Vice President and Chief Medical Officer, CVS Caremark

Scott Burris, J.D., Professor, Temple University School of Law

Robert A. Burt, J.D., Alexander M. Bickel Professor of Law, Yale Law School

lames F. Childress, Ph.D., Professor, University of Virginia

Paul D. Cleary, Ph.D., Dean and C.E.A. Winslow Professor of Epidemiology and Public Health, Yale University School of Public Health

Ruth R. Faden, Ph.D., M.P.H., Philip Franklin Wagley Professor of Biomedical Ethics and

Director, The Phoebe R. Berman Bioethics Institute, Johns Hopkins University

Lawrence O. Gostin, J.D., L.L.D., *Professor and Director, Center for Law and the Public's Health, Georgetown and Johns Hopkins Universities*

Christine Grady, R.N., Ph.D., Head, Section of Human Subjects Research, Department of Clinical Bioethics, National Institutes of Health

Dean M. Hashimoto, M.D., J.D., M.P.H., Associate Professor of Law, Boston College, and Chief of Occupational and Environmental Medicine, Massachusetts General Hospital and the Brigham and Women's Hospital

Timothy S. Jost, J.D., Robert L. Willett Family Professor of Law, Washington and Lee University School of Law

Ruth Katz, J.D., M.P.H., Dean and Walter G. Ross Professor of Health Policy, George Washington University School of Public Health and Health Services

David Kessler, M.D., J.D., Dean, University of California, San Francisco School of Medicine, and Former Commissioner of the U.S. Food and Drug Administration

Alvin K. Klevorick, Ph.D., John Thomas Smith Professor of Law and Professor of Economics, Yale Law School and Yale University Department of Economics

C. Everett Koop, M.D., Sc.D., Senior Scholar, C. Everett Koop Institute at Dartmouth College and Former Surgeon General of the United States

Stephen R. Latham, J.D., Ph.D., Deputy Director, Yale's Interdisciplinary Center on Bioethics

Jerold R. Mande, M.P.H, Director of Policy Programs, Yale University School of Medicine

Theodore R. Marmor, Ph.D., Professor, Yale University School of Management and Yale Law School

Leslie Meltzer, J.D., M.Sc., Greenwall Fellow in Bioethics and Health Policy, Georgetown University Law Center and the Johns Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health

Theodore W. Ruger, J.D., Professor, University of Pennsylvania Law School

Elyn R. Saks, M.Litt., J.D., Orrin B. Evans Professor of Law, Psychology, and Psychiatry and the Behavioral Sciences, University of Southern California Gould School of Law

^{*}Denotes Lead Editors for this issue.